

Committee date	Recipient & Committee item	Comments/Information requested	Response date	Response	Further Actions
3 JULY 2014	Leader Next Steps on Central Square	<p>Committee:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- stressed challenge of providing useful advice on a matter coming to Cabinet without having been provided the benefit of a written report</li> <li>- highlighted risk of providing feedback on a verbal presentation is of providing superficial scrutiny of a complex matter, or of being subsequently perceived to have failed in the task of holding decision makers to account</li> <li>- are reassured that you wish to closely engage scrutiny in the bus interchange discussions soon after the summer recess, and on an ongoing basis</li> <li>- request information on the process that will be developed to monitor the medium to long term economic impact of this project on Cardiff's economy, and in particular how the real and sustainable long term positive impact on employment will be monitored?</li> <li>- are comforted to know that officers are already thinking of the issues relating to difficulties in accessing information about bus route changes when stopping and boarding locations were moved out of the bus station. The Committee will monitor this through future scrutiny.</li> <li>- are interested to discuss views on the future of the bottom end of St Mary Street and its current concentration of licenced establishments</li> </ul>	13 OCT 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- the response stated the Cabinet members and officers will work to bring reports to Committee as soon as possible, but highlighted it is important to work closely with Scrutiny to share progress even when it may not be possible to produce full written reports.</li> <li>- stated that the Council will record both the number of jobs created within the development and the number of jobs supported through the work of the Council as part of usual performance monitoring. the number of jobs created through the construction phase will also be monitored.</li> <li>- stated that Central square development will not only create jobs on the site itself but also raised the overall competitiveness of the city and trigger further investment</li> <li>- officers will be undertaking work with stakeholders to develop plans for the period of temporary bus station measures. the area will remain accessible for individuals heading to and from the railway station</li> <li>- substantial work will underpin the development of a new transport hub, taking into account best practice from around the globe and undertaking analysis of the impact on bus and car movement.</li> </ul>	Transport Hub Inquiry will explore this further
2 OCT 2014	Leader Cardiff Business Council	<p>Committee:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- note that good progress has been made towards achieving the key priorities for Year 1. The Committee look forward to receiving future updates on the achievement of the 1000 membership target</li> <li>- recognise the important role the inaugural board of the Business Council has played but look forward to the Membership of the Board being refreshed via an election process</li> <li>- was keen to stress that the Council must be mindful in sharing risks and must be open to pushing ahead with projects at the pace of change expected within the private sector</li> <li>- were interested to hear the view that there is room in the market for two convention centres in South Wales and wishes to receive evidence that supports this point of view which is being used to inform the decision to proceed with a convention centre in Cardiff.</li> </ul>	26 NOV 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Intention for Business Council elections to be held in Spring 2016</li> <li>- Aim for a representative board with the following structure: 2 City of Cardiff representatives, 5 investinf partners elected by Business Council Members, 3 members co-opted by City of Cardiff Council, 2 elected members</li> <li>- gave evidence that shows there is room for two convention centres in South Wales</li> </ul>	
2 OCT 2014	Leader Economic Development Q1 Performance	<p>Committee:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- feels the Council must press ahead with the implementation of a Business improvement District in Cardiff.</li> <li>- are pleased to note that the Council is increasingly using informal networks to identify opportunities to promote the city. This is an area the Council could benefit from increased assistance from Cardiff Business Council, given its aspirations to engage with all businesses in Cardiff.</li> <li>- pleased to hear the aspirations for the Economic Development Team to be self funding. Recognise the efforts that have been made to identify additional income streams to balance overspends in the budget, but question whether this approach to addressing budget overspend is sustainable in the longer term.</li> <li>- The Committee wishes to be kept informed of developments with regards to the Coal Exchange. Such historic buildings are resources of Welsh national significance, and as such the burden of maintaining these buildings should not fall solely upon the City of Cardiff Council.</li> <li>- pleased to hear that links are being built between Economic Development and the education sector in Cardiff. Of particular interest are the efforts that are being made to produce 'job sheets' for distribution in schools informing young people on the key sectors of employment in Cardiff</li> <li>- emphasised that it feels Economic Development is not a discretionary service in respect of the Council's agenda for addressing individuals not in employment, education or training and therefore should be expected, if not required, to contribute to this agenda.</li> <li>- would welcome information from Neil Hanratty on the implications for the relocation of the bus station should the Traffic Commissioner wish to raise concerns</li> </ul>	26 NOV 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- given WG funding has not been secured for BID, the Council will now look to progress it with city partners</li> <li>- Coal exchange has transferred to the crown. Notes of a meeting with MP South Cardiff and Penarth included as appendix</li> </ul>	NH to provide requested information relating to bus station
2 OCT 2014	Leader Economic Development Team	<p>Committee:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- encouraged to hear about the positive performance of Cardiff across the range of indicators in respect of economic development</li> <li>- request the following additional figures: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Alternative measures of employment in Cardiff, namely the ILO Labor Force Survey figures.</li> <li>- The change in employment levels in the private sector vs public sector in Cardiff.</li> <li>- The average earnings in Cardiff, including breakdown across industrial sectors.</li> </ul> </li> <li>- recommends the development of a robust policy that will help inform decisions made by the Council in relation to vacant office spaces in the city.</li> <li>- welcome the ideas put forward by the Leader in relation to targeting international markets, NGOs and consulates for occupancy in this type of office accommodation, and would be interested in receiving more information on this.</li> <li>- hopes to see future updates of this kind linking back to the Economic Development Team's key performance indicators and the achievement of the objectives contained within the Corporate Plan.</li> </ul>	26 NOV 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- requested employment statistics provided</li> </ul>	
2 OCT 2014	Leader Economic Development Team	<p>Committee:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- encouraged to hear about the positive performance of Cardiff across the range of indicators in respect of economic development</li> <li>- request the following additional figures: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Alternative measures of employment in Cardiff, namely the ILO Labor Force Survey figures.</li> <li>- The change in employment levels in the private sector vs public sector in Cardiff.</li> <li>- The average earnings in Cardiff, including breakdown across industrial sectors.</li> </ul> </li> <li>- recommends the development of a robust policy that will help inform decisions made by the Council in relation to vacant office spaces in the city.</li> <li>- welcome the ideas put forward by the Leader in relation to targeting international markets, NGOs and consulates for occupancy in this type of office accommodation, and would be interested in receiving more information on this.</li> <li>- hopes to see future updates of this kind linking back to the Economic Development Team's key performance indicators and the achievement of the objectives contained within the Corporate Plan.</li> </ul>	27 NOV 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- requested employment statistics provided</li> </ul>	

Committee date	Recipient & Committee item	Comments/Information requested	Response date	Response	Further Actions
6 NOV 2014	Leader Cardiff Film Unit	Committee: - recognise the need for the Unit and value the work that is undertaken through it. - support the recommendation being put to the Cabinet to continue to provide a Cardiff Film Unit, moving towards a model that is aligned with overall levels of income that reflect annual forecasts of expected income. - would of liked Economic Impact Assessment to have been undertaken - is concerned Corporate Initiatives budget is fully committed, having written to numerous Cabinet members on this issue - is concerned that some areas of the Council bypass the Film Unit, and would like this practice addressed	16 DEC 2014	- the economic impact of the Film Unit is why it continues to be supported, however to fully undertake an assessment would be resource intensive and not considered a prudent use of money - the Film Unit is not considered an appropriate use of Corporate Initiatives money as it is intended to be an ongoing service, rather than a one off or discrete project - officers are looking to address areas of the Council bypassing the Film Unit	
6 NOV 2014	Cllr Bradbury Chapter Arts Centre	Committee: - support the recommendations to issue a new lease of 125 years with peppercorn rent to Chapter Arts Centre - is pleased significant work has gone into proposal, including economic impact assessment - is pleased partnership clearly exists between Council and Chapter - raised issue regarding risk with the lease, where Chapter will have responsibility for repairs and maintenance despite having no contingency in their budget should they require it	17 NOV 2014	- Cabinet paper updated to include risk relating to full repair and maintenance lease	
6 NOV 2014	Cllr Derbyshire Parks & Green spaces Strategic Framework	Committee: - requested the methodology for Quality Value Assessments of land - hope Members will be involved in any decisions on land disposal - feels the strategic framework must clearly set out where other directorates will be worked with - would not support a move toward alternative delivery models for parks and green spaces			
19 NOV 2014	Cllr Bradbury ADM Leisure & Cultural Venues T&F	Members: - were pleased previous comments had been taken on board - felt officers have worked hard to build a vision for the future of leisure and cultural venues in Cardiff - are pleased the tender process allows scope for innovation from the market, and also provides opportunities for SME's to bid for facilities - are pleased that retaining the inhouse service remains an option, should it prove competitive - would regard working with a partner organisation driven by social goals (such as a trust, charity or social enterprise) as our preferred option	1 DEC 2014	- All of comments made have been taken on board. - Role and commitment of Scrutiny in this project has been 'first class' and much appreciated by Cabinet member	
4 DEC 2014	Leader Q2 Performance - Economic Development	Committee: - questioned the performance in relation to responding to Member Enquiries, with only 38% of enquiries responded to on time - question why the performance Indicator in relation to the amount of grant aid and private sector finance attracted by companies assisted by the Council is not rated 'red' rather than 'amber' as there is acceptance it will not be achieved.			
4 DEC 2014	Cllr Bradbury Welsh Public Library Standards	Committee: - expressed their congratulations for the Council's achievements against the Welsh Public Library Standards this year. Committee is pleased that Cardiff has achieved above the Welsh average for 2013/14, and that the Council has increased the number of Standards met for each year of the fourth quality framework of Welsh Public Library Standards. - would like clarification around the contribution of Community Libraries towards the achievement and evaluation of the Welsh Public Library Standards. The Committee recommends that this issue is formally raised with the Minister, and feels strongly that all Library provision supported by the Local Authority, even if the building is maintained by an external organisation, should contribute toward the achievement of the Welsh Public Library Standards in Cardiff.			
4 DEC 2014	Cllr Bradbury Future Provision of Library Services	- welcomes the fact that this has been undertaken at an early stage, allowing for public consultation to take place, and publishing an options paper on the Council's website - did not fully accept th reasons given for closing Central Library not being considered, and would be interested in receiving evidence of CyMAL's viewpoint on the closure of Central Library to sustain seven community libraries, and also CyMAL's point of view on the proposed future options as a whole - requested the research that has been undertaken into the approaches taken in other local authorities across the United Kingdom - are not convinced that a clear strategy is yet in place to attract community and commercial interest further than publishing a toolkit on the Council's website - question whether enough thought has been put into the tender processes required, should a commercial option be sought - would be interested to know what support services have been explored for Community groups or trusts, and recommend a system similar to that of the Governor Support Service available for school governors be considered. - has strong reservations about the Council looking to charging the public to use Libraries - would be interested to know what plans are in place to upskill existing staff to enable them to undertake these new roles and new ways of working. - request that information on the plans to promote and push the e-book and e-zine service are sent to the Committee, as Members question whether the public are aware that Council libraries offer this service. - request that the results of the consultation exercise, interpretation of the figures, and information on commercial and community groups that have come forward in relation to the various branch libraries is provided for the Committee's consideration.			
4 DEC 2014	Cllr Bradbury CARL (Community Action for Rumney Library)	Committee: Is concerned to hear of class instructors being turned away from Rumney Library and being informed to look for alternative venues to hold their class, as the facility will be closing. Committee worries that these actions make it appear that a decision on the Library has already been predetermined, and could jeopardise the public perception of the consultation period. Committee also fears that, should a decision be reached to keep Rumney Library open, the Council could have driven away potential sources of income, which will be vital to the future sustainability of such a facility.			
4 DEC 2014	Cllr Bradbury Q2 Performance - Sport, Leisure & Culture	Committee: - were pleased to hear about the high profile events that have been supported by the directorate in the past few months - were also pleased to note that there have been improvements in the number of Member Inquiries responded to on time and a 19% reduction in complaints to the directorate. - are concerned that Sickness Absence is rising and that the level of sickness absence in this directorate is one of the highest in the Council. The Committee will explore this further in Q3. - reiterated the point made at the meeting that Councillors should be kept informed when in-year mitigating actions are taken to respond to financial or service delivery pressures.			

Committee date	Recipient & Committee item	Comments/Information requested	Response date	Response	Further Actions
4 DEC 2014	Cllr Howels Facilities Management Issues	Facilities Management has been raised a number of times in recent months as creating issues for other service areas performance. Committee requests that these issues are explored by PRAP when next scrutinising Facilities Management.			
1 DEC 2014	Cllr Patel Cardiff Central Transport Hub 1 Joint T&F	Members: - feel strongly that the decisions on the bus station are of utmost importance to the city, and should be given the appropriate status by the Cabinet - request that further analysis is done by extracting and analysing responses from individuals who do not live in the city - welcome assurances that information on the range of stakeholders involved in informing the Cabinet decision, the viability of both proposed locations for the new bus station, and the impact the changes will have on journeytimes in the city, will be included in the Cabinet report	12 DEC 2014	- To say that the survey was not targeted to people outside Cardiff is incorrect. Anyone with access to the internet worldwide could access and fill in the survey and the media coverage publicised this. - The consultation took place between 08 August and 03 October and was split into two parts. Part 1 (online survey, three press releases, dedicated forums) and Part 2 (external advertising, printed surveys distributed, queen street events, use of Cardiff Panel) - The bus station consultation produced 3717 responses, well over this average for the Ask Cardiff survey - work has been undertaken to evaluate non-cardiff responses. On the basis of the responses received, there is little evidence of any significant difference of opinion amongst residents and non-residents	
13 DEC 2014	Cllr Patel Cardiff Central Transport Hub 2 Joint T&F	Members: - cannot escape the feeling that the plans for a new bus station have been development led rather than led by transport priorities. It appears the Council has prioritised the development of Central Square and the new bus station has been left to fit around the remaining space - Expressed concern with regard to the footprint allocated to the new bus interchange, and the capacity this leaves for adequate numbers of bus stands. Members were disappointed that the Council is making do with an area of land and exploring how best to fit a bus station into it, rather than dictating the land requirements for a world-class bus interchange, that fits seamlessly. - recommend that the designs for street layout and footpath routes surrounding the current bus station footprint are reviewed in order to provide the maximum space possible for the new bus interchange - feel the plans for the new bus interchange have not been future proofed, and are concerned that this facility will not be able to meet increased demand, particularly in light of population growth estimates for the city and the emphasis the Council places on encouraging the public to use public transport rather than private cars. - Were left with the impression that the Council is currently being overly cautious in this respect, and feel it should take a strong position, fining all motorists who drive irresponsibly and inconsiderately - feel that the Council has a vitally important role to play in communicating changes during the 2 year transitional period, and in directing the public to their buses or to information around bus routes - Members were disappointed not to find information on the full range of stakeholders engaged with included in the Cabinet report, as was assured in the first meeting - Question whether the proposals for a bus interchange on the Network Rail Car Park (south of the railway line) was ever really a viable option, particularly given land ownership issues, the relationship that exists between the Council and Network Rail, and the clear stated preferences of bus operators within the city that the north is the favoured location			